October 2005

1.9

Narrative Benchmarks

1.9 In narrative writing, students organize and relate a series of events, fictional or actual, in a coherent whole. This is evident when students:

Pre K − 4:

- a. Recount in sequence several parts pf an experience or event, commenting on their significance and drawing a conclusion from them; or create an imaginative story with a clear story line in which some events are clearly related to the solution of a problem;
- b. Use dialogue and/or other strategies appropriate to narration; and
- c. Select details consistent with the intent of the story, omitting extraneous details.

5-8:

- a. Recount in sequence several parts of an experience or event, commenting on their significance and drawing a conclusion from them; or create an imaginative story with a clear story line in which some events are clearly related to the resolution of a problem.
- b. Use dialogue and/or other strategies appropriate to narration; and
- c. Select details consistent with the intent of the story, omitting extraneous details.

Grade 4 Benchmarks

1

Elf Has a Problem	4
Samantha Saves the Day	3
When I Fell Off My Bike	2
The Three	1
Cape Cod	1

1.9 Narratives *Revised Rubric*Grade 4

1.9 In written narratives, students organize and relate a series of events, fictional or actual, into a coherent whole.

Dimensions of Writing Standard 1.5 Criteria	Score Point 4 Shows evidence of exceeding the standard	Score Point 3 Shows evidence of meeting the standard	Score Point 2 Shows evidence of being below the standard	Score Point 1 Basic and limited writing
Purpose Context Establishes point of view, situation, problem/conflict/challenge, and plot, as necessary.	Establishes effective context Effectively presents main characters, conflict/problem/ challenge, and resolution	Establishes adequate context Presents characters, conflict/problem challenge, and resolution	Vague sense of context May lack resolution.	No context Lacks conflict/ problem/ challenge. and/or resolution
	Maintains clear topic and focus around central problem	Maintains clear topic and focus around central problem	Has topic, attempts focus	Topic and/or focus unclear
Organization Overall coherence Sequential Transitions	Strong beginning, middle, and end Uses transitions effectively.	Beginning, middle, and end, but beginning and/or end may need work Uses transitions	May have digressions and/or gaps in the story Few transitions	Little or no organization Major gaps in coherence Lacks transitions
Details/ Elaboration	Relevant, concrete details create vivid images	Details may create images	Some details may not be effective	May list some generic or random details
Dialogue	Details advance the action Effective use of dialogue and/or sensory and concrete details Shows character motivation, development, growth, or change	Details may advance the action May use dialogue, sensory and concrete details Shows character motivation and development	May only identify characters	May only identify characters
Voice and Tone Vocabulary Sentence structure Sentence variety	Uses precise language effectively and purposefully	Uses appropriate vocabulary	Uses below grade lev sentence structure	vel vocabulary and

Elf has a Problem

It was Christmas Eve. My family was all wound up. I was putting the cookies out for Santa. When my mom called from up stairs, "Get ready for bed dear." I layed the cookies on the coffee table and got ready for bed.

I layed in my bed to excited to go to sleep, so I went down stairs to get a drink, when I heard a thump.

I tip toed into the living room ready to hit a robber, and I saw an elf. He was saying to him self, "Oh deer oh deer how in the world did Santa do this?"

Then he started reading my families Christmas list and pulling the presents out of his bag that we had asked for. Then the elf layed them down under the stockings. He looked up the chimney and said, "Get up," after nothing happened he added, "Now how am I going to go up?"

"Maybe I could help," I said stepping out so he could see me.

"Oh no Santa said I'm not suppose to let anybody see me," he said sitting down with a frown on his face.

"Where's Santa?" I asked in wonder.

"He's sick," he said still frowning.

"Well maybe we could get a ladder and stick it up the chimney and you could climb up." I said.

"We'll make to much noise", he said. "But wait we could get that chair, put it in the fire place put some books on it, and you could stand on it and lift me up!" he said changing the frown to a smile.

YES." I screamed.

"Dear who are you talking to?" my mom asked from up stairs just waking up.

"Um the cat." I answered.

"Oh", my mom said yawning.

The elf was looking up the chimney when he sneezed.

"I'm coming down there dear you sound at if you have a cold, and you don't want to be sick for Christmas," my mom said.

My mom came down and felt my fore head.

"You seem all right," she said

"It was that elf that sneezed," I said pointing toward the fire place noticing he was gone. "He was," I said looking up the chimney.

"Go to bed dear you have a big day tomorrow," my mom said looking at me in a weird way.

That morning after all the presents were opened I found a note in the fire place it said: Thanks, by the way my name is Scott.

I was about to show my family the note, but than everybody would laugh at me. So I put it in my pocket and gave a secretive smile.

Elf has a Problem

It was Christmas Eve. My family was all wound up. I was putting the cookies out for Santa. When my mom called from up stairs, "Get ready for bed dear." I layed the cookies on the coffee table and got ready for bed.

Clear context

Effective use

of dialogue

I layed in my bed to excited to go to sleep, so I went down stairs to get a drink, when I heard a thump.

I tip toed into the living room ready to hit a robber, and I saw an elf. He was saying to him self, "Oh deer oh deer how in the world did Santa do this?"

Then he started reading my families Christmas list and pulling the presents out of his bag that we had asked for. Then the elf layed them down under the stockings. He looked up the chimney and said, "Get up," after nothing happened he added, "Now how am I going to go up?"

"Maybe I could help," I said stepping out so he could see me.

"Oh no Santa said I'm not suppose to let anybody see me," he said sitting down with a frown on his face.

"Where's Santa?" I asked in wonder.

Precise descriptors after "said" add to the tone of the piece

"He's sick," he said still frowning.

"Well maybe we could get a ladder and stick it up the chimney and you could climb up." I said.

"We'll make to much noise", he said. "But wait we could get that chair, put it in the fire place put some books on it, and you could stand on it and lift me up!" he said changing the frown to a smile.

YES." I screamed.

"Dear who are you talking to?" my mom asked from up stairs just waking up.

"Um the cat." I answered.

"Oh", my mom said yawning.

Complications add humor to the writing

The elf was looking up the chimney when he sneezed.

Vermont Department of Education

"I'm coming down there dear you sound at if you have a cold, and you don't want to be sick for Christmas," my mom said.

My mom came down and felt my fore head.

"You seem all right," she said

"It was that elf that sneezed," I said pointing toward the fire place noticing he was gone. "He was," I said looking up the chimney.

"Go to bed dear you have a big day tomorrow," my mom said looking at me in a weird way.

That morning after all the presents were opened I found a note in the fire place it said: Thanks, by the way my name is Scott.

I was about to show my family the note, but than everybody would laugh at me.

So I put it in my pocket and gave a secretive smile.

Precise language; satisfying ending

Effectiveness Score = 4

This well-paced, humorous narrative meets all the criteria for score point 3. In addition, the consistent use of precise language and the strong beginning and ending elevate the score to a 4.

Samantha Saves The Day

Hi! My name is Abby. This morning (August 21, 1997) I was peacefully watching TV in the living room when I heard a horrible RARRR 00000000! I went outside to see what it was. I saw that my cat Tiger was in the tree.

I said, (To my brother) "Why is the cat in the tree?"

My brother replied, "I ran the mower over his tail."

I finally got fed up and decided to try and get him down.

Meow Meow!!!

I went in to get a rope and tied it around the tree and started to climb up. Thinking everything would be fine. Crash! Out of nowhere I fell very painfully and broke my arm and my cat scurried farther up the tree. Off to the doctor I went. When I got home 2 hours later there was a fire truck in the driveway. There ladder could not reach the tree so they were thinking.

I went inside to called my friend Samantha,

And I said, "Samantha, my cat's in the tree! Will you come and help me get her down?"

She said, "Shore I will come over with Piggy and some milk."

Shore enough she came over with piggy and some milk. (Piggy was orange with brown spots and was a great tree climber). She poured some milk into Tiger's bowl. Then she let her cat go up there too. Then we left them alone for a while and before we knew it they were on the ground drinking the milk.

1.9 Narrative Grade 4 Effectiveness Score = 3

Samantha Saves The Day

Hi! My name is Abby. This morning (August 21, 1997) I was peacefully watching TV in the living room when I heard a horrible RARR 00000000! I went outside to see what it was. I saw that my cat Tiger was in the tree.

Problem

Adequate context

I said, (To my brother) "Why is the cat in the tree?"

My brother replied, "I ran the mower over his tail."

I finally got fed up and decided to try and get him down.

Meow Meow!!!

Thinking everything would be fine. Crash! Out of nowhere I fell very painfully and broke my arm and my cat scurried farther up the tree. Off to the doctor I went. When I got home 2 hours later there was a fire truck in the driveway. There ladder could not

I went in to get a rope and tied it around the tree and started to climb up.

Problem becomes more complicated

I went inside to called my friend Samantha,

reach the tree so they were thinking.

And I said, "Samantha, my cat's in the tree! Will you come and help me get her down?'

Dialogue used to advance action

She said, "Shore I will come over with Piggy and some milk."

Shore enough she came over with piggy and some milk. (Piggy was orange with brown spots and was a great tree climber). She poured some milk into Tiger's bowl. Then she let her cat go up there too. Then we left them alone for a while and before we knew it they were on the ground drinking the milk.

Problem resolved

Effectiveness Score = 3

This well-paced narrative is focused on the problem of the cat in the tree. The narrator has an appropriate voice that develops her character. Specific details advance the story line.

When I Fell Off my Bike

One day, I was riding my bike and I was not wearing a helmet because I did not have one. I went to my friend's house to see if he would come out and ride bikes with me. He said that he would, and we rode around. My handle bars twisted and I flipped over them. I lost control of my bike and landed on my head. I had a big cut on my head.

I was scared and hurt. All I wanted was my mom to fix me up. So I got on my bike and rode right home. My mom made me take a bath to clean up. This made it feel so much better! Then my mom put a band aid on my cut. If I had a helmet it would have protected me. I wouldn't have gotten cut or had to go home to take a bath.

I felt so much better that I wanted to go and ride my bike with my friends. I put on a hat because that was the closest thing I had to a helmet. If I fell again, maybe my hat would get ripped an not my head!

I finally got a helmet from my grandmother, but my bike chain broke so I no longer have a bike! So now I use the helmet for my skateboard. The lesson I learned is always to wear a helmet when I am riding a bike or a skateboard.

1.9 Narrative
Grade 4
Effectiveness Score = 2

When I Fell Off my Bike

One day, I was riding my bike and I was not wearing a helmet because I did not have one. I went to my friend's house to see if he would come out and ride bikes with me. He said that he would, and we rode around. My handle bars twisted and I flipped over them. I lost control of my bike and landed on my head.

Purposeful

elaboration needed here on the problem

Vague context

I had a big cut on my head.

I was scared and hurt. All I wanted was my mom to fix me up. So I got on my bike and rode right home. My mom <u>made</u> me take a bath to clean up. This <u>made</u> it feel so much better! Then my mom put a band aid on my cut. If I had a helmet it would have protected me. I wouldn't have gotten cut or had to go home to take a bath.

Dialogue needed to show, not tell

I felt so much better that I <u>wanted</u> to go and ride my bike with my friends. I <u>put</u> on a hat because that <u>was</u> the closest thing I had to a helmet. If I fell again, maybe my hat would get ripped an not my head!

Weak verbs (underlined)

I finally got a helmet from my grandmother, but my bike chain broke so I no longer have a bike! So now I use the helmet for my skateboard. The lesson I Reflection learned is always to wear a helmet when I am riding a bike or a skateboard.

Effectiveness Score = 2

This narrative needs elaboration, dialogue, and sensory language at significant points in the story. The writer's voice is weakened by generic verbs, over-use of the personal pronoun "I," and pale vocabulary. There is good sentence variety and complexity, and the narrative has a tight chronological structure.

Note: This is a personal narrative with emphasis on the story line, not a personal essay, which would emphasize reflection.

The Three

David, Molly, Christina, Cindy, and Brad lived in a very peaceful place. David was the father and Cindy was the mother. Molly and Christina were the sisters. Brad was the brother.

David and Cindy went away on a vacation and left Christina in charge of the sisters and brother. A week past and the newspaper came it said that there parents got in a car accident and they died. They where very sad.

Then another newspaper article came and said that a kidnapper might come to town. So everybody started to move away. Then when the day came they where ready to fight and save their town.

When they went in the dinning room they thought of David and Cindy but that wasn't the only thing they had to put in mind. The kidnappers was headed for their house! So they ran out the back door and climbed in the tree. When they went out "BANG!" they attacked Molly, Christina, and Brad. They ran fast in a garage and made a plan. Brad was going to lurid them into the garage. Their was a lot of equipment. So they hit them till they fainted then they would call the police.

I guess your wondering what happened to the kids well the sisters where doing police paper and Brad was a police officer at the city hall police station.

1.9 Narrative
Grade 4
Effectiveness Score = 1

The Three

David, Molly, Christina, Cindy, and Brad lived in a very peaceful place.

David was the father and Cindy was the mother. Molly and Christina were the sisters. Brad was the brother.

Weak context

David and Cindy went away on a vacation and left Christina in charge of the sisters and brother. A week past and the newspaper came it said that there parents got in a car accident and they died. They where very sad.

Problem established but is much too broad for a narrative

Then another newspaper article came and said that a kidnapper might come to town. So everybody started to move away. Then when the day came they where ready to fight and save their town.

When they went in the dinning room they thought of David and Cindy but that wasn't the only thing they had to put in mind. The kidnappers was headed for their house! So they ran out the back door and climbed in the tree. When they went out "BANG!" they attacked Molly, Christina, and Brad. They ran fast in a garage and made a plan. Brad was going to lurid them into the garage. Their was a lot of equipment. So they hit them till they fainted then they would call the police.

Pronouns are vague and cause confusion

Lapse in coherence

I guess your wondering what happened to the kids well the sisters where doing police paper and Brad was a police officer at the city hall police station.

Effectiveness Score = 1

This narrative is a series of listed events with no purpose and no elaboration. The writer has a limited understanding of "conflict;" it does not have to mean "action movie." The problem does have a beginning, middle, and end, but the lack of details also causes lapses in coherence. Characters are listed, and their "world" is not believable.

1.9 Narrative Grade 4

Cape Cod

One day this summer family, except my dad, went to Cape Cod for two days. We drove about 6 hours from Hereck to Cape Cod. It was a long trip. When we got there it was hot and we went on the Mayflower 2. We also went to Plymouth. Then we went farther down to the curve. We slept in Motels over the nights. The Motels were nice. We went to three different beaches and we found lots of nice rocks on the beaches. The second day we had to go back home because it cost too much money. I didn't really want to go back home because it was so nice there. It was a nice trip to Cape Cod.

9 Narrative
 Grade 4
 Effectiveness Score = 1

Cape Cod

One day this summer family, except my dad, went to Cape Cod for two days. We drove about 6 hours from Hereck to Cape Cod. It was a long trip. When we got there it was hot and we went on the Mayflower 2. We also went to Plymouth. Then we went farther down to the curve. We slept in Motels over the nights. The Motels were nice. We went to three different beaches and we found lots of nice rocks on the beaches. The second day we had to go back home because it cost too much money. I didn't really want to go back home because it was so nice there. It was a nice trip to Cape Cod.

Little context; no characters identified

List of reported details; no problem; no elaboration

Effectiveness Score = 1

This writing starts off as a narrative but ends up a report. It lacks a conflict or problem, and the details are generic ("nice" rocks, motel, trip). The voice is a monotone, with mainly subject-verb, simple sentence structure. A number of the sentences can be rearranged to no effect; the writing has no internal organization.